

Appendix: Russian Center-Periphery Relations from Khrushchev to Putin, 1957-2018

I applied the following criteria to achieve the best proximate equivalency in classifying all 791 regional leaders adapted to the different political contexts and circumstances in both the Soviet Union and Russian Federation over these past six decades. Any regional leader born and educated in the same region is classified and termed a local (*mestnyi urozhnets*). Yet, for a more comprehensive equivalence of regional leaders in the Soviet and Russian eras, the classification local also includes those who spent a cumulative minimum decade of residency at lower-level positions inside the region before acceding to its leadership. Especially in the Soviet era spent, it was not uncommon for *obkom* 1st secretaries to have been promoted from the ranks after a minimum decade of residency at lower-level CPSU *nomenklatura* positions in construction, factories, *Komsomol*, trade-union, and the Communist Party inside their regions. They and similar Russian-era leaders by this minimum decade of prior positional residency are all presumed to have formed the same level of regional origins through their prior careers equivalent to Locals by their birth and education over the first decades of their lives.

Leaders classified an outsider (*varyag*, literally meaning Varangian) are those born and educated outside the region without a minimum decade of prior positional residency in the regions before their accession. For the Soviet era, outsiders were those dispatched by the Center to lead regions as *obkom* 1st secretary without any prior background or minimal decade of residency at lower-level positions inside the same region. Outsiders in both eras also are those who while born were not educated in the regions and lacked the minimal decade of prior positional residency to be classified Locals. This distinction as outsider includes a few Russian-era Senators nominally representing the region in the national legislature in Moscow before becoming its governor but without the decade of prior positional residency inside the region.

The year 1957 was chosen as the first of the last 34 years for comparison of the Soviet era. Khrushchev was 1st Secretary since 1953, but his effective authority by most analysts would be considered June 1957 with his ouster of the so-called “Anti-Party Group” in the Presidium. The years any *obkom* 1st secretaries in 1957 may have held their positions before 1957 are not counted, only 1957 and any subsequent years of their tenures. In 1963-64, Nikita Khrushchev’s bifurcation reform of the Communist Party instituted two agricultural and industrial committees, bureaus, and *obkom* 1st secretaries in several regions. Both 1st secretaries were counted in the total number of leaders either local or outsider for the region in 1957-90, but only the two years in 1963-64 held by the 1st secretary prior or

subsequent to the bifurcation reform were counted in the cumulative percentage of years led by that leader classification in 1957-90. The two years by the other bifurcation-era 1st secretary in 1963-64 were excluded from the cumulative percentage of years in 1957-90.

The year 1991 was counted the first *de facto* year of the Russian Federation from the events transpiring over these last five months. They included the abortive August putsch, President Yeltsin's suspension of the Communist Party, his presidential appointees to lead Russian regions, and his secession of the RSFSR from the Soviet Union in December. The *obkom* 1st secretaries already were being forced out of office even before August with the fracturing of regional Communist authority throughout 1989-91. The year 2018 is counted the 28th of the Russian Federation through President Putin's re-election on March 18, 2018.

Eleven regional leaders headed their regions as both *obkom* 1st secretaries during the Soviet era and equivalent governors during the Russian era.¹ They were counted twice as both a Soviet-era and a Russian-era regional leader and twice by their years as a leader in each era for these 11 regions. Regional leaders in more than one of the 83 regions are counted each time in calculating the ratios and percentage of years by region and era. Any year with both a local and outsider serving as the leader was tabulated as local in calculating the ratios and years governed for that region and era.

With 18 exceptions, the 83 regions in 2018 for the most part are the very same political jurisdictions in both the Soviet and Russian eras. Four regions – Krasnoyarsk, Perm', Irkutsk, and Kamchatka – are the same but include regions gaining short-term federation subject status from 1991 reincorporated into them as subsidiary political entities in 2005-07. The leaders of these 1991-2007 federation subjects were counted in the composite leadership classification of Russian-era leaders in these four regions for 1991-2018. A fifth region – Trans-Baikal – was created in 2008 from the merger of a 1957-2007 Chita region and a 1991-2007 Agin-Buryat region, both of whose leaders until the 2008 merger are counted in the composite classification of Trans-Baikal for 1991-2018.

Eleven of the 2018 Russian regions were not in the Russian Union-Republic, but emerged as separate federation subjects of the Russian Federation only after 1991: Saint Petersburg, Nenets, Yamalo-Nenets, Khanty-

¹ Yegor Stroev (Orel), Yurii Litvintsev (Tula), Mukha Aliev (Dagestan), Valerii Kokov (Kabardino-Balkariya), Aleksandr Dzasokhov (North Ossetia-Alania), Akhsarbek Galazov (North Ossetia-Alania), Yurii Spiridonov (Komi), Viktor Stepanov (Kareliya), Vitalii Mukha (Novosibirsk), Gennadii Khodyrev (Nizhnii-Novgorod), Mintimer Shaimiev (Tatarstan).

Mansi, Adygea, Karachaevo-Cherkessiya, Nenets, Khakasiya, Altai Republic, Chukotka, and Yevreiskaya, A 17th – Ingushetiya – was part of the combined Soviet-era Chechen-Ingushetiya region and split off after 1991 as a separate federation subject. The leaders of the previous Chechen-Ingushetiya are included under Chechnya for 1957-90, although Chechnya as a separate federation subject is the 18th essentially new Russia-era region since 1991. With the forced mass exile of ethnic Chechens and Ingush to Kazakhstan by Stalin in 1944, leaders in both regions born before 1991 in Kazakhstan exile were still classified as native Locals of Ingushetiya or Chechnya.

I cross-checked a wide range of sources to compile the 791 biographies. Names and tenures of leaders from 1957 through 2018 are accessible from the Internet websites of World Leaders and World Statesmen.² For the Soviet era, biographies are accessible from a wide variety of Internet websites, including archival biographies in the *Reference Source on the History of the Communist Party and the Soviet Union 1898-1991*,³ CPSU Central Committee members,⁴ and deputies elected to the Russian Union-Republic and Russian Federation Congresses.⁵ These Internet sources were supplemented by biographical directories of all deputies elected every four years to the All-Union Supreme Soviet (*Deputaty Verkhovnogo Soveta SSSR*), biographical appendices of all CPSU Central Committee members in the Soviet annual yearbooks (*Ezhegodniki Bol'shoi Sovetskoi Entsiklopedii*) published concurrently with every CPSU Party Congress since 1971, and in-house biographical directories of Radio Liberty in the 1980s.⁶ Detailed biographies for leaders since 1991 in all regions are posted sequentially by their tenures on the Russian Internet website *Vikipedia – svodnaya entsiklopediya* and English website *Wikipedia*.⁷ They were

²World leaders at <http://worldleadersindex.org/russian%20administrative%20divisions.html> and World Statesmen at http://www.worldstatesmen.org/RussSFSR_admin.html.

³*Spravochnik po istorii Kommunisticheskoi partii i Sovetskogo Soyusa 1898-1991* at <http://www.knowbysight.info/GGG/02236.asp>.

⁴ The sub-link “Central Committee” under *History of the Communist Party of the Soviet Union* at https://ipfs.io/ipfs/QmXoypizjW3WknFiJnKLwHCnL72vedxjQkDDP1mXWo6uco/wiki/Central_Committee_elected_by_the_27th_Congress_of_the_Communist_Party_of_the_Soviet_Union.html.

⁵ *Spisok narodnykh deputatov RSFSR/RF* at <https://dic.academic.ru/dic.nsf/ruwiki/504703/Список>.

⁶ Gavin Helf, 1987 and 1988, *A Biographic Directory of Soviet Regional Leaders, Part I: RSFSR Oblasts, Krai, and ASSRs* (Munich, Germany, Radio Liberty Research, Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty).

⁷ Discounting the superfluous comments and information in *Vikipedia* and *Wikipedia* to discredit or embellish biographies, both still provide easily accessible and accurate objective information on the origins and careers of all regional leaders cross-checked from the original Russian biographical sources footnoted and cited for each entrée.

supplemented by regional archival sub-links in the *Guides to Archives of Russia*.⁸ For the transitional year 1991 and the decade of the 1990s, especially informative as resources were two volumes on all the federation subjects published by the Carnegie Center in Moscow and a series of monographs for a more limited number of regions published by the Slavic Research Center of Hokkaido University in Japan.⁹ Journalists and social scientists in all the Russian regions wrote essays in these publications commissioned by the Carnegie Center and Hokkaido University Slavic Research Center on the transitional era of the 1990s in their locales.

⁸Regional sub-links of *Putevoditeli po arkhivam Rossii* at <http://www.guides.rusarchives.ru>.

⁹Michael McFaul & Nikolai Petrov, 1998, eds, *Politicheskii al'manakh Rossii, 1991-1997*, [Political Almanac of Russia, 1991-1997], Volumes 2 and 3 (Moscow, Carnegie Center); and Kimitaka Matzuzato, 1997 & 2000, ed, *Regiony Rossii: Khronikia i Rukovoditeli*, [Regions of Russia: Chronicle and Leaders], Monograph Volumes 1-7 (Sapporo Japan, Hokkaido University Slavic Research Center).