

Anti-Americanism, Anti-Westernism, and Anti-Semitism among Russia's Muslims

GORDON HAHN

Abstract: An expression of much of the Islamic world's clash with Western civilization is its anti-Americanism, anti-Westernism, anti-Semitism, and Islamic solidarity. Russia's Muslims are no exception. Many in the West regard Samuel Huntington's "clash of civilizations" as absurd and Russia's Caucasus militants as representing a noble national liberation movement rightly seeking their separation from an imperial or colonial power, as they have for centuries. Russia's more traditional Muslims express the same limited and prejudiced range of opinions toward the West that many Muslims around the world do, writ large. More ominously, the global jihadist element is beginning to hold sway over the Caucasus Islamist militants. As a result, Russia's Caucasus jihad reflects much of the rabid anti-Americanism, anti-Westernism, anti-Semitism, and Islamist solidarity that jihadists across the globe espouse.

Keywords: anti-Americanism, anti-Semitism, anti-Westernism, Islam, jihadists, terrorism

Although many in the West do not subscribe to Samuel Huntington's view regarding a "clash of civilizations," many of the world's Muslims and all Islamists do. An expression of the Islamic world's clash with Western civilization is its rabid anti-Americanism, anti-Westernism, anti-Semitism, and Islamic solidarity. Russia's Muslims are no exception. They express the same limited and prejudiced range of opinions that many Muslims around the world do toward the West. Despite this, some in the West persist in believing that even Russia's most extremist Muslims—the North Caucasus jihadists led by the Chechen hub calling itself the Chechen Republic of Ichkeriya (ChRI)—are neither jihadists nor militants.¹ Many analysts believe the Caucasus militants compose a noble national liberation movement rightly seeking their separation from an imperial or colonial power, as they have for centuries.² They scrupulously and relentlessly subject Russian actions to microscopic analysis and harsh criticism, but largely ignore and routinely abstain from criticizing the Caucasus jihadists' means, methods, and ideology.³

Gordon Hahn is author of *Russia's Islamic Threat* (Yale University Press, 2007), *Russia's Revolution from above, 1985–2000: Reform, Transition, and Revolution in the Fall of the Soviet Communist Regime* (Transaction Publishers, 2002), and numerous scholarly and analytical articles on politics, Islam, and terrorism in Russia. He has taught at both Russian and U.S. universities and has been a visiting fellow at the Hoover Institution and the George F. Kennan Institute for Advanced Russian Studies. Copyright © 2008 Heldref Publications

In fact, the Islamist element has held sway over the Chechen militants since the summer of 2002. Islamists Shamil Basayev and Shariah Court Chairman Abdul-Khalim Sadulayev forced President Aslan Maskhadov to amend the ChRI constitution, subordinating him and the constitution to Shariah law as interpreted by Chechen and other Caucasus jihadists. The Chechen separatist movement expanded the war to the wider North Caucasus region and aimed to expand it to all of Russia's "Muslim lands" to establish an Islamic state or federation of Islamic states. The Caucasus jihad adopted the global jihadist tactics of suicide bombing and improvised explosive devices. Ideological declarations were increasingly Salafist Islamist in character, championing Shariah law, martyrdom, Islamic caliphates, and anti-infidelism over Chechen or Caucasus nationalism and independence, anticolonialism, and anti-Russian elements.⁴

I will examine anti-Americanism, anti-Westernism, and anti-Semitism—all of which for purposes of brevity I refer to at times as *anti-infidelism*—among Russia's various Muslim orientations as reflected in the jihadists' and the moderate Muslim elite's discourses on global affairs. Anti-American messages from the outside Muslim world, Russia's Islamic media and elite, and non-Islamic Russian media are among the factors that foster such sentiments among Russia's Muslims. I focus on Muslim articulations because Western media and think tanks have covered anti-infidelism extensively, while coverage of Russia's Muslims has been nonexistent. The Islamic political elite, as the Muslims' leadership and as potential and kinetic ethnoconfessional entrepreneurs, are of pivotal importance for the direction that many of Russia's re-Islamizing ethnic Muslims might take in the future, particularly in relation to jihad against Russian or other infidels. The Islamic elite play the key role in Russian politics for Muslims and their articulations in the media possess the potential to turn Russia's mainstream Muslims against the "infidel." There is considerable anti-infidelism, especially anti-Americanism and anti-Semitism, among Russia's Caucasus jihadists, the official and unofficial Muslim elite, and even simple ethnic Muslims.

Anti-Infidelism among Russia's Jihadists

The ChRI jihadists articulate the most virulent anti-infidelism among Russia's Muslims and, to a great degree, their discourse surpasses traditional Russian anti-Westernism and anti-Semitism and rising anti-Americanism. The ChRI leaders' statements are particularly instructive because they are representative of Russia's larger jihadist network, for which the ChRI serves as a hub for nodes around the North Caucasus and elsewhere, and are influencing not only its more Sufi and nationalist operatives but also some Muslims across Russia.

Some top ChRI jihadists have not been shy about criticizing the United States and stating their affection for Osama bin Laden. Others have done so in more restrained form. The late inspirational leader, network organizer, and internationally wanted terrorist Shamil Basayev simultaneously expressed his admiration for Osama bin Laden and his disdain for the United States in a March 2005 interview:

I have never been acquainted with Bin-Ladin and have had no contact with him, although I would very much like to meet him. . . . One thing I know for certain is that he cannot fundamentally be a villain because his face gives out a strong light in all the photographs, which I have been lucky enough to see. From my own experience I know that America and Rusnya [derogatory term for "Russia"] love to decide who the guilty people are and do not allow them even a word to say in order to justify themselves. An example of this is the story of the

weapons of mass destruction in Iraq and Saddam, whose overthrow I always supported, but not for the benefit of America, but because I saw in this advantage for the Muslims.”⁵

If this statement does not make the ChRI network's potential to act against the West sufficiently clear, a more strident comment attributed to Basayev should: “Scoundrel Western crusaders, bogged down in lechery, and you, hoggish Jews, I have ordered my Muslim brothers and sisters, the Chechens, staying in your filthy countries to annihilate you without taking any compassion on you.”⁶

In an interview with a Turkish newspaper, Abu Havs al-Urdani, the late emir (commander) of the Al-Ansar Volunteer Brigades (foreign jihadists from al Qaeda and other groups), killed in November 2006, stated:

When did America speak the truth about Muslims? Do they really say the truth about Iraq? What have they said about the Iraqi and Afghan peoples? On the background of what they have done, are they honest in calling the Palestinian mujahedin to democracy and human rights? Is not their real goal the conquest of Muslim countries, the murder of Muslims and the enslavement of peoples, and have they not laughed at Islam and Muslims?⁷

Abu Havs noted that al Qaeda: “Like other groups of mujahedin, they help Islam and oppressed Muslims. As regards Osama bin Laden . . . he is one of the leaders of the jihad.”⁸

Although the late ChRI president Aslan Maskhadov generally abstained from anti-American and anti-Western statements, his successors Abdul-Khalim Sadulayev and Doka Umarov were less reluctant to do so. During President Bush and other Western leaders' visit to Moscow to celebrate the sixtieth anniversary of the allied victory over Nazi Germany, the then-ChRI emir/president condemned Western leaders as “leader-hypocrites” for their friendly relations with Putin:

Your words of greeting in the capital of the state-aggressor sounds like justification for the murder of more than 25 percent of the population of the Chechen state. Your handshakes with Putin and other leaders of Russia signify approval of the experience of the fascist concentration camps Buchenwald and Auschwitz being applied today by the Russian occupiers against Chechens, and your applause at Putin's parade is perceived as excitement for the murder of 45 thousand Chechen children.⁹

In Chechen and jihadist circles such transgressions are punished by death. Sadulayev further disclosed his suspicion of and antagonism toward the West in his August 2005 announcement dissolving the late Maskhadov's Ichkerian government abroad and firing all of his foreign representatives: “[A]ccording to ChRI's special services, future Karzais are being prepared from among them for the Chechen people in prestigious Western institutions of higher education.”¹⁰ Sadulayev's derogatory reference to Afghan president Hamid Karzai clearly shows on whose side the Chechen Islamists stand; as do other jihadists, the Ichkeriyans view Karzai as a U.S. puppet and a traitor to Allah. Umarov, Sadulayev's successor, has revealed his own antagonism toward the United States:

It has been long since we should have thrown all political niceties into the garbage heap. If the Chechens will have 100 ballistic missiles with nuclear warheads, then everyone will instantaneously pay attention to the human rights violations [committed by the Russians against Chechens]. And if the Chechens will be prepared to poison about a thousand first sort, racially privileged American children each day, then they will immediately recognize and receive them [Chechens] in the State Department. It is to you that in the State Department they classify Chechen children lower than rare types of monkeys. We are believers. A person

without faith is not a whole person. We are on Allah's path; it is a sacred path for us. So we are obligated to perform the jihad. Today there is a superpower that the entire world believes cannot be defeated militarily—that idea also needs to be analyzed.¹¹

Under Maskhadov, Sadulayev, and Umarov, the Chechen Islamists' propaganda organs have carried blatantly anti-American, anti-Western, and anti-Semitic messages, both those produced internally and others gleaned from foreign Islamic and Islamist media sources.¹² The following are typical representations of America, the West, and democracy found on the ChRI jihadists' Web site Kavkaz Tsentr: "Satanism in Action: 'Skull and Bones' Rules America," "The Americans Burned Woman and Children with White Phosphorous," "The USA Is Sending Murderers of Children to Iraq," "It Looks Like Western 'Freedom' Is Quite Satanized," "To Be Live Cattle—That's Western Democracy," "Moscow's Militia Has Protected the Scarecrow of Putin, Bush and Blair," "Toilet Paper with the Image of Putin, Bush and Blair Has Come Out," and "50% of Americans Are Spiritually Ill."¹³ A November 2005 article urges jihadists to "break the heads of Bush and Condoleezza Rice."¹⁴

The Caucasus jihadi Web sites often pair the United States and Russia together as former Cold War-era "satans." An article posted on the ChRI Web site, Chechenpress.org, equates Bush and Putin with Hitler and Stalin in an attempt to divvy up the world to their advantage.¹⁵ Kavkaz Tsentr published an article accusing the United States of another transgression: assisting the Russians in killing President Dudayev in 1995 and Chechen field commander Ruslan Gelayev in 2003.¹⁶ One Kavkaz Tsentr article equates the United States with the Soviet Union and democracy with socialism, all regarded as antipodes to the Islamic *umma* in a religiously defined, bipolar international system: the Islamic monotheists against the lying kafirs or polytheists. Consequently, the author Said Minkailov predicts the collapse of American democracy and Russia as comparable parts of the "society of unbelievers" and "the society of lies." Minkailov assures his readers: "Muslims get outraged in vain by the abundance of lies in Russian or Western propaganda. We do not get outraged when a snake emits venom or a pig looks for dirt: such is their nature." In "the war between monotheism and the mendacious world of unbelief," "America, Western Europe, Russia, and everybody else who has excessive weaponry are cynically and hypocritically using 'human rights' when justifying their aggressions. And as we can see, these so-called 'rights' can be attached to anybody but Muslims."¹⁷ Note that these views, including the inevitable collapse of the United States, parallel those of Osama bin Laden's second-in-command, Ayman al-Zawahiri.¹⁸ Such is the ideology of the Chechen Islamists, who now control the Chechen separatist movement—and ideology dictates politics.

The ChRI jihadists not only support al Qaeda and its ideology but also Iraq's mujahedin, Afghanistan's neo-Taliban, and the jihadist movements around the globe, at least morally. Other global jihadists benefit practically from the additional front and training ground that the Caucasus jihad affords them. ChRI Web sites refer to U.S. and Western forces in Iraq and Afghanistan as "occupiers" and "infidels," while those fighting alongside or working with American and allied forces are "collaborationists" and "puppets."¹⁹ Iraq's al Qaeda and indigenous jihadists are said to implement "martyrs' attacks," which are inevitably compared favorably to the "USA's crimes."²⁰ The United States is even charged with feigning the 9/11 attacks as a pretext for undertaking "the genocide of Muslims and the destruction of Islam."²¹

Chechenpress.org, based, along with "foreign minister" Akhmed Zakayev, in London, is less jihadist than Kavkaz Tsentr. Nevertheless, it is an anti-infidel instrument. For

example, one of its postings portrays the West's intervention in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Kosovo as an effort to preempt the victory of the Bosnian and Kosovar jihads. The article also excuses, if not justifies, the murder of Dutch filmmaker Theo Van Gogh by Muslim Algerians and, according to some reports, Chechens, because of Van Gogh's alleged slander of Allah and Islam. The article also charges Ayaan Hirsi Ali, the film's producer and author of the recent bestselling book *Infidel*, with Islamophobia.²²

Jews and Israel are also targets of the Web site's ire. Kavkaz Tsentri specializes in the standard Islamist/Wahhabist anti-Semitism and support for Israel's destruction in articles such as "Jewish Religious Figure Raped 9 Children," "Award for Abomination: A Jew Completes the Sexual Revolution in America," "Jewish Rabbis Have Forbid Doctors to Treat Palestinians," "Israel Will Be Destroyed in the Year 2022," and "Zionists Are Provoking the War between Sunnis and Shiites in Iraq."²³ The Ichkeriyani jihadists also are firm deniers of the Holocaust (a word they usually put in quotation marks), as seen in Kavkaz Tsentri's articles such as "One More Witch Hunt Trial against the Next 'Holocaust' Denier in Austria," "192 Caricatures of the 'Holocaust' Have Already Been Entered in the International Competition," "The Holocaust as International Racket," among many others.²⁴ After al Qaeda and other Islamists' terrorist attacks in Iraq, Egypt, and elsewhere, Kavkaz Tsentri obfuscates and disinforms with articles such as "Mossad Is Carrying Out Terrorist Attacks in Iraq" and "'Mossad' May Stand behind the Terrorist Act in Egypt."²⁵

Kavkaz Tsentri has a special rubric titled "Their Morals," which features its own and foreign reports on the most decadent, vile, and perverse crimes committed by criminals and the criminally insane in the United States, the West, Russia, and Israel, portraying them as representative of life in "infidel" countries. These types of ideology and propaganda, including the inevitable collapse of the United States, closely parallel those of Osama bin Laden and Mullah Omar.²⁶ The anti-American, anti-Western, anti-democratic, anti-Semitic, xenophobic, and Islamofascist aspects of the ideology of the ChRI Islamists, who now control the Chechen separatist movement, should be kept in mind by policymakers and analysts who tend to focus on the Russians' war crimes to the exclusion of the jihadists' egregious crimes against humanity.

Russia's emerging Islamist network therefore expands the pool of recruits for the jihadist cause. Some of Russia's Islamists already have participated in the international Islamist network's jihad against the United States. Chechens have turned up fighting against U.S. forces in Afghanistan, Pakistan, and Iraq. Muslims from the North Caucasus and Volga area were among the Taliban and al Qaeda fighters in Afghanistan arrested by U.S. forces and taken to Guantanamo Bay in 2002.²⁷ Pakistani security forces reported killing Chechen militants in March 2006 and June 2007, with those in the first battle reportedly associated with al Qaeda.²⁸ Chechens fought and killed American forces in Iraq, including at the battle of Fallujah in 2004.²⁹ Indian

"The ChRI jihadists not only support al Qaeda and its ideology but also Iraq's mujahedin, Afghanistan's neo-Taliban, and the jihadist movements around the globe, at least morally."

police uncovered a Chechen-led al Qaeda cell, which planned to assassinate Vice Admiral V. J. Metzger, commander-in-chief of the U.S. Seventh Fleet, during a trip to India.³⁰

Anti-Infidelism in Russia's Mainstream Islam

Russia's jihadists are not the only Muslims in Russia to side with Islam—even radical Islam—against the United States and the West. More moderate Muslims (and non-Muslims) in Russia, including leading muftis of Russia's various official Muslim spiritual administrations and their umbrella organizations, show a moderate but no less real solidarity with radical foreign Islamic and Islamist movements and are highly antagonistic in their attitudes toward the United States, the West, and Israel. Various sources—the outside Muslim world, the Caucasus jihadists, non-Islamic Russian media, Islamic Russian media and clergy, and other opinion makers—insert anti-infidelism into Russia's mainstream Muslim world. Therefore, even the traditionally moderate Tatar Muslims are producing rabid Americanophobes. The Naberezhnoye Chelninskoye Otdelenie Vse-Tatarskogo Obshchestvennogo Tsentra was reportedly approached by numerous (according to some reports, hundreds of) volunteers for the Taliban's post-9/11 jihad that was to help Afghanistan fight against the United States. A February 2003 Vse-Tatarskii Obshchestvennyi Tsentra (All Tatar Public Center) plenum "sharply criticized" U.S. policy in Iraq.³¹ During the November 2004 U.S. operation to rid Fallujah of Iraqi Islamists, Tyumen Oblast's leading Muslim cleric Fatykh Garifullin, an ethnic Tatar, called on his Muslim community to pray for Fallujah's Muslims, commenting: "There is no limit to the outrage towards the Americans' actions. If the world community does not stop the war in Iraq, the fate of the besieged martyrs in Fallujah awaits all who do not agree to dance to the tune of Bush and his circle. . . . I call upon all Muslims to conduct prayers for their co-believers so that the Almighty will help Iraq's heroic people to save their independence and freedom."³²

Media controlled by official Muslim organizations produce a constant stream of anti-American, anti-Western, and anti-Israeli propaganda. The Coordinating Center of the Muslims of the North Caucasus's (CCMNC) Web site, Islam.ru, routinely publishes both internally generated articles and reprinted articles from foreign Islamic and Islamist media critical of the United States, the West, and Israel. Islam.ru routinely posts commentary referring to U.S. "aggression against Afghanistan and Iraq" and U.S. officialdom's "Arabophobia," "Islamophobia," "radical Zionism," "extremist position," and "aggressive line in relation to Muslims."³³ Typical commentary charges the United States with "sowing injustice, hatred, and crimes against humanity around the world."³⁴ Islam.ru posted an article asserting that the U.S. military "teaches its soldiers that all Muslims are terrorists" and that U.S. forces continued to "torture" detainees long after the Abu Ghraib scandal.³⁵ According to Islam.ru, when the U.S. State Department invited Russia's leading North Caucasus muftis to visit the United States, four of seven declined the invitation because of their opposition to President Bush and the war in Iraq.³⁶ The same Web site carried a commentary speculating that Dagestan's chief mufti was not invited to the United States because of his "commentaries and analyses unpleasant for the USA" on its Web site.³⁷

A frequent line of thought is that Israel and Jews control U.S. policy. Thus, one Russian Muslim Web site posted a November 3, 2003, article from the Saudi Arabian newspaper *al-Watan* purportedly showing that "the USA is hiding the connection of Israel with the events of September 11."³⁸ Thus, it is hardly surprising that some of Russia's Muslims would be willing to join a jihad against the United States and the West.

Another aspect of Russia's anti-American discourse is some Islamic intellectuals' inclination toward the Eurasian school of Russian nationalism espoused by Aleksandr Dugin and Aleksandr Panarin. Their brand of neo-Eurasianism recommends a "holy alliance" between the Christian Orthodox and Islamic (and, for some, the Sinese) civilizations against the secular American or "Atlantist" globalizing juggernaut.³⁹ The Eurasianists have formed their own party, the Eurasian Party, which includes Orthodox Russians, ethnic Russian Muslims, and traditionally Muslim nationalities. Khozh-Akhmed Nukhayev, former Chechen official under first Chechen President Dzhokar Dudayev, rejected participation in the second Chechen war and has supported ending the war. He joined forces with Dugin's Eurasian Party in 2003 at a Moscow conference that established a permanent relationship ostensibly working toward an end to the war and the unification of Russia and the Muslim world against the "Atlantist" threat.⁴⁰ Nukhayev's own writings reveal the anti-Americanism of a high-ranking former official in the earlier governments of Dudayev and Zemilkhan Yandarbiev.⁴¹

Leading Muslim clergy, such as Shafiq Pshikhachev, the chairman of the Coordinating Center of the Muslims of the North Caucasus (CCMNC), and Muslim intellectuals, such as Dr. Vyacheslav Polosin, chairman of the Muslim Committee Gaidar Jemala and chairman of the Union of Muslim Journalists (UMJ), proselytize neo-Eurasianism's anti-Western and often anti-Zionist ideas on CCMNC's Web site, Islam.ru. This can be seen in many of the statements surrounding the creation of the Muslim civil rights organization Haq, of which Jemal and Polosin are founders and leading members. The declaration of Haq's founding assembly notes: "The goal of Russia's enemies is not to permit [Russia's] economic growth and political influence of the Great Russian Power, and for this they want to destroy the historically established complimentary 'union of Russians and Tatars' and of Orthodox and right-believers and to direct the peoples of our country against each other and provoke centripetal forces." Haq board member Sergei Komkov told Haq's founding assembly: "Forces antagonistic to Russia as well as to the Muslim world lobby Islamophobia, which serves as one of the levers for Russia's destruction."⁴²

Eurasianists often portray the United States and Israel as organizing elaborate conspiracies to turn Russians and Muslims against each other as part of an overall Zionist strategy to establish a new world order. Islam.ru published an article by an ethnic Russian Muslim of the Eurasian persuasion that found "such monsters" as the United States and Israel to have been the forces behind the Beslan plot: "They want us to ask forgiveness for the actions of those who were brought up by the CIA and Mossad for the implementation of geopolitical provocations against the Islamic world."⁴³ A Chechen advisor to President Putin implied the same in remarks following Beslan.⁴⁴ In Islam.ru's Eurasianist world, al Qaeda is nothing but a myth dreamt up "to make zombies of Russians as NATO approaches Russia's borders."⁴⁵ The growing popularity of Eurasianism among Russian elites and its propagation in mass media reinforce both Islamic, Islamist, and Russian nationalist propaganda inculcating anti-Americanism, anti-Semitism, anti-Westernism, and anti-globalization sentiments among Russia's Muslims.

Implications

I have discussed elsewhere the potential threats that Russia's jihadists pose to American interests.⁴⁶ The Caucasus jihadists' anti-infidelism underscores the extent of that threat by highlighting that the set of possible targets could extend far beyond the Caucasus to the West just as the larger global jihadist movement, of which the ChRI is a part, does. In a

sense, the West is in a difficult situation. There are costs for cooperating with Russia in the war on terrorism and muting public criticism of Moscow's frequently brutal prosecution of counterinsurgency operations. A letter featured on the Chechen Kavkaz Tsentr Web site indicates just how the failure of the United States and other Western governments to condemn Russian violations of human rights and the international laws of war, among other factors, inclines some Chechens to support global jihad and target American interests:

Having taken the side of the bloody aggressor, Western governments and their international political institutions have become direct participants in the genocide of the Chechen people. They are trying to drive those Chechens who remain alive under the yoke of the evil

“Media controlled by official Muslim organizations produce a constant stream of anti-American, anti-Western, and anti-Israeli propaganda.”

empire, which is also continuing today the bloody bacchanalia before the eyes of “civilized Europe.” The legitimate authorities of Ichkeriya must take all of these facts into account and exclude the protectors of genocide from the future peace process.⁴⁷

Moreover, a Kavkaz Tsentr report titled “The American Army—an Army of Sodomites and Perverts” signaled that the ideological lens of both the global jihadists and their allied ChRI militants predisposes them to see U.S. forces as a paper tiger:

The American army intends to take into its ranks more actively sodomites and so-called lesbians who have openly declared their sick perversion. . . . Meanwhile, two-thirds of those (soldiers) who knew that sodomites serve in their units stated that they do not think this hurts the army's morale.⁴⁸

On the other hand, if the ChRI is supported as a national liberation movement on a par with the Polish Solidarity movement or the Baltic republics' drive for independence from the Soviet Union, as many who are focused on an alleged Russian threat suggest, then the emergence of a very dangerous jihadist force in the heart of Eurasia is possible. This will strengthen the impression that a desert wind is blowing from the East, to paraphrase Mao. Between Russia's two increasingly anti-Western, anti-American forces—the radical Caucasus jihadists on the one hand and much of the Russian state's elite on the other—the latter is clearly the more moderate of the two forces.

A comparison of these two elements' attitude toward Teheran's policies highlights the difference between them. In an article titled “God You Can Deny, but Not the ‘Holocaust,’” Kavkaz Tsentr warmly reported Iranian President Mahmoud Ahmadinejad's December 11–12, 2006, “scientific conference” ostensibly debunking the “myth” of the Holocaust. The report identified the Simon Wiesenthal Center as an institution tied to the Israeli secret services.⁴⁹ In sharp contrast, Russian Foreign Ministry Spokesman Mikhail Kamynin said on December 13 that his government “opposes any distorting of historical events, hiding the truth about monstrous Nazi crimes, or revising the outcome of mankind's difficult struggle against Nazism.”⁵⁰ The Russian government's official newspaper, *Rossiiskaya gazeta*, reported on the conference in condemnatory fashion and highlighted

the castigating remarks of Russian State Duma Deputy Mikhail Margelov, who characterized the Iranian president's policies as "a threat to the entire world" and recommended the world's "reaction to the Iranian conference should be extremely harsh."⁵¹

To be sure, Russian capabilities far outweigh the jihadists' means at present. However, the jihadists' intentions are monstrously aggressive. The Russians' behavior, for now at least, is at worst an irritant to the community of democracies, and Moscow has assisted the United States and the West in the war on terrorism. Moreover, the Russian state's anti-Americanism is in part a product of the United States' gravely mistaken Russia policy of the 1990s. NATO and EU expansion without Russia and the failure to meaningfully assist the Russian people during the time of economic troubles or criticize Yeltsin's oligarchic and limited democracy blocked Russia's way westward and discredited democracy and the market; hence Russia's turn eastward. A modest corrective to Western Russia policy—for example, the repeal of the Jackson-Vanik amendment, Russia's entry into the WTO, and closer ties between NATO and Russia—could help reverse Russia's turn east. Some *modus vivendi* with the Kremlin would likely lead to an end of its tolerance, and at times encouragement, of anti-Americanism among Eurasian Muslims, other Muslims, and non-Muslims. This, in turn, would further distance Russia's official DUMs, muftis, and imams from militancy and jihadism, undercutting albeit a less-than-vital pillar of support for jihadist ideas in Russia. Moreover, Russia's growing Muslim population will give ethnic Muslims a plurality of the Russian population around midcentury. Probable difficulties in incorporating this population into a Russia that conceptualizes itself as ethnic Russian and Christian Orthodox will limit Russia's ability to cozy up to Islamists and Islamist states. These factors keep open the option of returning to the West. One might say the bear's ambivalent hug is preferable to the mujahedin's sword.

NOTES

1. For those who doubt the now dominant role of the global jihadist ideology and pan-Islamic goals of the ChRI, see Gordon M. Hahn, *Russia's Islamic Threat* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2007).

2. Moshe Gammer, *The Lone Wolf and the Bear: Three Centuries of Chechen Defiance of Russian Rule* (Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2006); John B. Dunlop, *Russia Confronts Chechnya: Roots of a Separatist Conflict* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).

3. This view is espoused in many publications on the North Caucasus produced by think tanks such as the Jamestown Foundation, the Hoover Institution, and their commentators.

4. Hahn, *Russia's Islamic Threat*.

5. See Interview with Basayev, "Sh. Basayev: 'Nikto ne mozhet zapretit mne to, chto razreshaet Bog'" Kavkaz Tsentri, March 21, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/03/21/31642.shtml> (accessed March 21, 2005).

6. This was in an e-mail purportedly sent by Basayev to the Institute for War and Peace Reporting on August 27, 2004, just days before the Beslan school incident. See Tom de Waal, "Basayev and Maskhadov Under Pressure," *IWPR Caucasus Reporting Service*, no. 252, September 8, 2004.

7. "Amir Abu Khafs: 'Molodyozh' vykhodit na Dzhikhad. . .," Kavkaz Tsentri, November 10, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/11/10/48243.shtml> (accessed November 10, 2006).

8. "Amir Abu Khafs: 'Molodyozh' vykhodit na Dzhikhad. . ."

9. "Prezident ChRI Sadulaev vystupil s obrasheniem," Kavkaz Tsentri, May 9, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/05/09/33702.shtml> (accessed May 9, 2005).

10. "Obrashchenie Prezidenta ChRI A.-Kh. Sadulaeva k chechenckomu narodu," Kavkaz Tsentri, August 19, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/08/19/36843.shtml> (accessed August 19, 2005).

11. Amirkhan Rashidov and the Kavkazsky tsentr strategicheskikh issledovaniy imeni Z. Yandariyeva, "Bud'te stoiki v spravedlivosti," Kavkaz Tsentr, September 11, 2007, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2007/09/11/52885.html> (accessed September 11, 2007). Umarov remarked earlier and less stridently: "We are believers. A person without faith is not a whole person. We are on Allah's path; it is a sacred path for us. So we are obligated to perform the jihad. Today there is a superpower that the entire world believes cannot be defeated militarily—that idea also needs to be analyzed." Andrei Babitsky, "RFE/RL Interviews Chechen Field Commander Umarov," RFE/RL, July 28, 2005, <http://www.rferl.org/featuresarticle/2005/07/c7fd0ff2-647f-42ea-827b-42812c1e8a0a.html> (accessed July 28, 2005).

12. Islam.ru posted excerpts from Iranian Chief Ayotollah Ali Khomeini's annual speech on the anniversary of the 1979 revolution, typically an anti-American tirade. See "Poslanie dukhovnogo lidera Irana musulmanam mira," Islam.ru, <http://www.islam.ru/pressclub/analitika/poslanie/> (accessed December 27, 2007).

13. Musa Stoun, "Satanizm v deistvii: 'Cherep ikosti' pravyat Amerikoi," Kavkaz Tsentr, April 13, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/04/13/43682.shtml> (accessed April 13, 2006); "Amerikantsy szhigali irakskikh zhenshchin i detei belym fosforom," Kavkaz Tsentr, November 8, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/11/08/39130.shtml> (accessed November 8, 2005); "SShA otpravlyayut v Irak ubiits detei," Kavkaz Tsentr, October 10, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/10/10/38329.shtml> (accessed October 10, 2005). Pokhozhe, chto zapadnaya 'svoboda' sovsem osatanela," Kavkaz Tsentr, April 14, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/04/14/43744.shtml> (accessed April 14, 2006); "Byt' zhivotnoi skotinoi—eto zapadnaya demokratiya," Kavkaz Tsentr, March 5, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/03/05/42580.shtml> (March 5, 2006); "Moskovskaya militsiya otstoyala chuchela Putina, Busha i Blera," Kavkaz Tsentr, March 5, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/03/05/42606.shtml> (March 5, 2006); "Vypushchena tualetnaya bumaga s izobrazheniem Putina, Busha, i Blera," Kavkaz Tsentr, October 10, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/10/10/38319.shtml> (October 10, 2005); and "50% amerikantsev stanoviyatsya dushevno bolnymi," Kavkaz Tsentr, June 7, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2005/06/07/34825.shtml> (June 7, 2005).

14. Andrei Novikov, "Shamil Basaev kupil nosh," Kavkaz Tsentr, November 23, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2005/11/23/39653.shtml> (accessed November 23, 2005).

15. "Yadernyi apokalipsis," *Chechenpress.org*, July 30, 2007, <http://www.chechenpress.org/events/2007/07/30/01.shtml> (accessed July 30, 2007).

16. "Voina protiv Islama i rech Busha," Kavkaz Tsentr, October 10, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/10/10/38307.shtml> (accessed October 10, 2005).

17. Said Minkailov, "Terminologicheskaya voina," Kavkaz Tsentr, June 18, 2004, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2004/06/18/22366.shtml> (accessed June 18, 2004). See also Said Minkailov, "Vtoraya Mirovaya voina glazami chechenskikh modzhahedov," Kavkaz Tsentr, April 11, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/04/11/32959.shtml> (accessed April 11, 2005).

18. See *The 9/11 Commission Report: Final Report of the National Commission on Terrorist Attacks upon the United States*, Authorized Edition (New York: W. W. Norton, 2004), 123.

19. See "V Irake rasstrelyany 10 kollaboratsionistov," Kavkaz Tsentr, April 20, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/04/20/33012.shtml> (accessed April 20, 2005); "Taliban: Dzhikhad prodolzhaetsya," Kavkaz Tsentr, October 10, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/10/10/38310.shtml> (accessed October 10, 2005); "V 2005 godu v Afganistane bylo unichtozheno 655 amerikanskikh soldat," Kavkaz Tsentr, March 11, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/03/11/42763.shtml> (accessed March 11, 2006); "V Bagdade unichtozheny 5 munafikov," Kavkaz Tsentr, March 25, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/03/25/43133.shtml> (accessed March 25, 2006).

20. For one of many examples, see "Irak: Ataki Shakhidov. Vystupleniye al-Masri. Novoe prestupleniye SShA," Kavkaz Tsentr, May 6, 2007, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2007/05/06/50854.shtml> (accessed May 6, 2007).

21. "Tsel' SShA – genotsid musul'man i unichtozhenie Islama," Kavkaz Tsentr, May 30, 2007,

<http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2007/05/30/51193.shtml> (accessed May 30, 2007).

22. See Zelimkhan Khadzhiyev, "Islamophobia na vakhte," Chechenpress.org, November 9, 2006, <http://www.chechenpress.info/events/2006/11/09/02.shtml> (accessed November 9, 2006).

23. "Premiya za merzost. Yevrei sovershili seksualnuyu revolyutsiyu v Amerike," Kavkaz Tsentr, January 11, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2006/01/11/40946.shtml> (accessed January 11, 2006); "Yevreiskie ravviny zapretili vracham lechit' palestintsev," Kavkaz Tsentr, April 15, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/04/15/43766.shtml> (accessed April 15, 2006); "Religiozniy yereiskii deyatel' iznasiloval 9 detei," Kavkaz Tsentr, April 7, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/04/07/43537.shtml> (accessed April 7, 2006); "Israel budet razrushen v 2022 godu?" Kavkaz Tsentr, April 14, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/04/14/43739.shtml> (accessed April 14, 2006); and "Sionisty provotsiruyut v Irake voynu mezhdru sunnitami i shiitami," Kavkaz Tsentr, March 11, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/03/11/42749.shtml> (accessed March 11, 2006).

24. "Yeshchyo odin 'protsess ved'm' protiv ocherednogo otritsatelya 'kholokosta' v Avstrii," Kavkaz Tsentr, March 5, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/03/05/42597.shtml> (accessed March 5, 2005); "Na mezhdunarodnyi konkurs postupilo uzhe 192 kari katury o 'kholokoste,'" Kavkaz Tsentr, March 12, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/03/12/42793.shtml> (accessed March 12, 2006); and "Kholokost, kak mezhdunarodnyi reket," Kavkaz Tsentr, January 26, 2007, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2007/01/26/49344.shtml> (accessed January 26, 2007).

25. See "Mossad provodit terakty v Irake," Kavkaz Tsentr, May 2, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/05/02/44225.shtml> (accessed May 2, 2006); and "Za teraktom v Egipte mozhet stoyat Mossad," Kavkaz Tsentr, April 25, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/04/25/44038.shtml> (accessed April 25, 2006).

26. See *The 9/11 Commission Report*, 123.

27. Two Muslims each were from the republics of Kabardino-Balkariya (KBR), Tatarstan, and Bashkortostan in addition to one from Chelyabinsk and one from Tyumen Oblasts. At least two were ethnic Tatars and at least one was an ethnic Kabard. See Regions.ru, March 27, 2003, <http://www.regions.ru> (accessed March 27, 2003); RFE/RL, Newline, March 28, 2003; RFERL Russian Federation Report, April 17, 2002; and "Russia's 'Taliban' Faces Uneasy Future after Guantanamo Torment," Agence France Presse, August 1, 2004.

28. "Chechen Fighters Killed in Attack on Pakistani Village," *Retwa.org*, June 21, 2007, <http://www.retwa.org/home.cfm?articleId=4291> (accessed June 21, 2007).

29. Patrick K. O'Donnell, *We Were One: Shoulder to Shoulder with the Marines Who Took Fallujah* (Cambridge, MA: Da Capo Books, 2006), 51, 128–29, 137, 168–69. For another case, see the comments in 2005 by Iraqi Interior Minister Falah al-Naqib in "Iraq's Al-Naqib—'Terrorists' From Chechnya, Sudan, and Syria Killed, Arrested," *Beirut LBC SAT Television*, January 30, 2005.

30. See Rohan Gunaratna, *Inside al Qaeda: Global Network of Terror* (New York: Berkely Books, 2003), 292.

31. "Putin Tries Incremental Rather Than Radical Reform in the Countryside," RFE/RL Russia Report, February 21, 2003, <http://www.rferl.org/reports/rpw/2003/02/8-210203.asp> (accessed February 21, 2003).

32. "Glava Tyumenskogo kazyyata prizval molitsya za musulman Falludzhi v Noch Predopredeleniya," Islam.ru, November 9, 2004, <http://www.islam.ru/press/rus/2004-11-09/> (accessed November 9, 2004).

33. See, for example, "Blizhnemu Vostoku Vashington gotovit Pletku," Islam.ru, November 29, 2004, <http://www.islam.ru/pressclub/tema/pletka> (accessed November 29, 2004); and "Normalizatsiya ili imitatsiya. SShA khotyat druzhit s musulmanami," Islam.ru, <http://www.islam.ru/pressclub/analitika/friendship/> (accessed November 29, 2004).

34. Abid Ulakh Dzhan, "Moment istiny dlya Ameriki," Islam.ru, December 11, 2004, http://www.islam.ru/pressclub/tema/moment/?print_page (accessed December 11, 2004).

35. "V Amerikanskoj armii soldat uchat tomu, chto vse musulmane—terroristy," Islam.ru, December 14, 2004, <http://www.islam.ru/press/world/2004-12-14/#6796> (accessed December 14, 2004).

36. Only Ingushetiya's mufti Isa Khamkoev, Kabardino-Balkariya's mufti Anas Pshikhachev,

and North Ossetiya's mufti Murat Tavkazakov accepted the invitation and made the visit in August 2007. See "Prodolzhaetsya visit v SShA troikh iz semi severnokavkazskikh muftiev," Islam.ru, August 7, 2007, <http://www.islam.ru/rus/2007-08-07/#17093> (accessed August 7, 2007).

37. "Pishem—mufti, v ume—ayatolly. Zachem Dzh Bush priglasil severokavkazskikh musul'manskikh deyatelei," Islam.ru, August 24, 2007, <http://www.islam.ru/pressclub/smi/buprisem/> (accessed August 24, 2007).

38. "SShA skryvayut svyaz Izraelya s sobyitiyami 11 sentyabrya," *Islam-info.ru*, April 13, 2004, <http://www.islam-info.ru/?a=255> accessed (April 13, 2004).

39. See Aleksandr Dugin, *Osovy geopolitiki* (Moscow: Arktogetia, 1997) and A. S. Panarin, *History's Revenge* (Moscow: Logos, 1998).

40. See Ya. A. Goldin, *Rossiia i Chechnya: Poiski vykhod* (St. Petersburg: Zvezda, 2003), 49–51, 56.

41. *Ibid.*, 49–51, 56, 118–25, 180–85.

42. See "Musul'manskii message v otvet na 'putinskii prizyv,'" Islam.ru, October 22, 2004, <http://www.islam.ru> (accessed October 22, 2004).

43. Artur Yastrebov, "Tragediya Beslana i perspektivy russkikh musul'man," Islam.ru, September 22, 2004, <http://www.islam.ru> (accessed September 22, 2004). See similar Islam.ru commentary in David Merkhav, "Za chto pogibli nashi deti?" Islam.ru, September 22, 2004, <http://www.islam.ru/pressclub/histori/zio-khronic/> (accessed September 22, 2004) j/ and by Muslim Eurasianist Geidar Dzhemal in "Eksperty rassuzhdali, Khazam 'lomal komediyu,' a Porokhova opyat vykinula syurpriz," Islam.ru, October 15, 2004, <http://www.islam.ru/press/rus/2004-10-15/> (accessed October 15, 2004).

44. "Pomoshchnik V. Putina fakticheski obvinil SShA v organizatsii teraktov v Rossii," Islam.ru, September 7, 2004. (accessed September 7, 2004);

45. See "Mify ob 'al-Kaide' oslepili 77% rossiyan," Islam.ru, October 25, 2005, <http://www.islam.ru/press/rus/2004-10-25/> (accessed October 25, 2005).

46. Hahn, *Russia's Islamic Threat*, chapter 7, and Gordon M. Hahn, "The Perils of Putin's Policies," *Journal for International Security Affairs* 10 (Spring 2006): 63–72.

47. Abu Rashid, "Oni pytayutsya zagnat' chechentsy pod yarmo imperii zla. . ." Kavkaz Tsentr, June 17, 2005, <http://www.kavkazcenter.net/russ/content/2005/06/17/35194.shtml> (accessed June 17, 2005).

48. "Amerikanskaya armiya—armiya sodomitov i izvrashchentsev," Kavkaz Tsentr, January 4, 2007, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2007/01/04/49047.shtml> (accessed January 4, 2007).

49. "Boga otritsat' možno, 'kholokost' nel'zya," Kavkaz Tsentr, December 12, 2006, <http://www.kavkazcenter.com/russ/content/2006/12/12/48748.shtml> (accessed December 12, 2006).

50. RFE/RL, Newline, December 14, 2006.

51. Nadezhda Sorokin, "Predskazanie Akhmedinzhada," *Rossiiskaya gazeta*, December 14, 2006, <http://www.rg.ru/2006/12/14/ahmadinezhad.html> (accessed December 14, 2006).

Subscribe Today!



In today's over-saturated mediascape, *Current* delivers provocative and thoughtful articles, essays, and book reviews reprinted from the nation's most respected periodicals. Covering society, education, politics, history, and events of the day, *Current* presents a multifaceted look at the issues and debates that shape today's world and will determine our future. Published ten times a year, *Current* is a source of readings that will stimulate lively class discussion and challenge readers with intriguing viewpoints on today's key issues.

Monthly (Combined Mar/Apr, Jul/Aug); ISSN 0011-3131

Regular Annual Subscription Rates:

Individual: \$47 print only

Institutional: \$117 print only

Add \$18 for postage outside the U.S.

CALL OR VISIT US ONLINE TO SUBSCRIBE!

Libraries may order through subscription agents.



Subscription Offices:

PO Box 830350

Birmingham, AL 35283-0350

P. 866.802.7059 ■ F. 205.995.1588

heldref@ebSCO.com ■ www.heldref.org

History & POLITICAL Science

In today's world of constant change, it is hard to keep up to date with world events and all their implications. Heldref Publications offers journals that give readers access to communications among scholars from around the world, including both full-length articles and book reviews. Editors and advisors from universities and elsewhere in the scholarly community maintain a high standard for the subjects covered in each publication. Whether you are interested in political theory, Southeast Asia, post-Soviet democratization, studies in quantitative and interdisciplinary history, or reviews of the latest history books, Heldref publishes a journal you won't want to miss.

To place an order,

please copy this form and mail or fax; visit our Web site at www.heldref.org or call customer service at (866) 802-7059.

Heldref Publications

Subscription Office Address:

PO Box 830350, Birmingham, AL 35283-0350
Toll Free Number: (866) 802-7059 • Fax Number: (205) 995-1588
Phone Number for outside of the US and Canada: (205) 995-1567
Email address: heldref@ebsco.com

PUBLICATION #1		COST	
PUBLICATION #2		COST	
		Please include appropriate international shipping costs.	
		TOTAL COST	
ACCOUNT #	(MasterCard/VISA)	SECURITY CODE	EXP. DATE
SIGNATURE			
NAME/INSTITUTION			
ADDRESS			
CITY/STATE/ZIP		COUNTRY	

Asian Affairs An American Review

Quarterly

Individual: \$60 online only, \$63 print and online
Institutional: \$144 online only, \$144 print only,
\$172 print and online

(Add \$14 for postage outside the U.S.)

Current

Monthly (Combined Mar/Apr, Jul/Aug)

Individual: \$47 print only

Institutional: \$117 print only

(Add \$18 for postage outside the U.S.)

Demokratizatsiya

The Journal of Post-Soviet Democratization

Quarterly

Individual: \$55 online only, \$58 print and online

Institutional: \$137 online only, \$137 print only,
\$164 print and online

(Add \$16 for postage outside the U.S.)

Historical Methods

A Journal of Quantitative and Interdisciplinary
History

Individual: \$68 online only, \$71 print and online

Institutional: \$182 online only, \$182 print only,
\$218 print and online

(Add \$14 for postage outside the U.S.)

History Review of New Books

Quarterly

Individual: \$75 online only, \$79 print and online

Institutional: \$181 online only, \$181 print only,
\$216 print and online

(Add \$14 for postage outside the U.S.)

Perspectives on Political Science

Quarterly

Individual: \$72 online only, \$76 print and online

Institutional: \$179 online only, \$179 print only,
\$214 print and online

(Add \$14 for postage outside the U.S.)

World Affairs

Quarterly

Individual: \$60 online only, \$63 print and online

Institutional: \$132 online only, \$132 print only,
\$159 print and online

(Add \$14 for postage outside the U.S.)



www.heldref.org

Heldref Publications is a division of the nonprofit Helen Dwight Reid Educational Foundation